



How Far Has The Talent Management Helped? a Central Java Government Experience

Sindi Arisandi^{a1*}, Maratun Saadah^{b2}

^aBadan Kepegawaian Daerah Provinsi Jawa Tengah, Semarang, 50136

^bUniversitas Jambi, Jambi, 36361

[¹arisandisindi@gmail.com](mailto:arisandisindi@gmail.com)*, maratunsaadah@unja.ac.id²

INFO ARTIKEL

Riwayat Artikel:

Diterima: 09-10-2023

Disetujui: 22-10-2023

Dipublikasikan: 28-10-2023

Keywords:

1. Talent Pool
2. Talent Scouting
3. Talent Management

ABSTRAK

Abstract: This study provides a deep analysis of the contextual variables that affect the Central Java Provincial Government's best utilization of talent pools are looked at. Talent pools are collections of high-performing workers who have been selected for taking on more responsibility and occupying key roles within the company. Since public sector organizations are constantly expected to provide effective and efficient public services while operating in a financially constrained environment and facing a persistent talent shortage as well as rising competition for talent, effective talent pool utilization is especially important in an emerging economy. The study investigates the contextual elements within a local government that could potentially limit the best implementation of a talent management strategy. It does this by drawing on talent management theory and basing its findings on a case study with interviews conducted with thirteen key individuals within the Central Java Provincial Government. The results of this study show that the Central Java Provincial Government's use of talent pools in the public sector is not optimal due to a number of factors, such as the creation of talent pools that do not meet needs, the absence of participant roles, and the absence of an understanding of the appraisal process. The absence of explanation for maintaining abilities is a further element identified. These results are known to be impacted by a lack of resources, a lack of opportunities for talent development, a lack of support from and engagement from leaders, and an incomplete deployment of talent management systems.

----- ◆ -----

INTRODUCTION

There is no denying that one of the most important difficulties facing government today is attracting, developing, and retaining talent (Gallardo-Gallardo, Thunnissen, and Scullion 2020). It has been shown that companies that effectively manage their people resources are more likely to produce remarkable results and preserve competitive advantage (Pagan-Castaño et al. 2022). Government Regulation Number 11 of 2017 about Management of Civil Servants and Law Number 5 of 2014 concerning State Civil Apparatus states that the Civil Servants Management system shall be implemented based on a merit system while upholding the ideals of justice, fairness, and openness (hartati, Muliasari, and Madan 2022). Based on this regulation, the Provincial Government of Central Java through the Regional Personnel Agency held talent scouting to assess civil servants competence (Setiadhie and Wibowo 2020).

The Central Java Provincial Government was one of the pioneers in implementing an open promotion system through the concept of talent scouting for the positions of administrator and supervisor. Context, content, process, leadership and results are important indicators of the extent to which talent scouting has been successfully implemented by the Central Java Provincial Government. It is important to maintain

objectivity and use clear, concise language with a logical structure. Common academic sections should be included and formatting should adhere to style guides. Grammatical correctness is necessary without bias, ornamental or figurative language. The implemented changes must align with the vision of change and related concept changes to ensure success.

With growing concern about the quality of administrative leaders, there have been a number of efforts to select bureaucratic leaders in different regions. Innovations range from the popular 'term position auction' in the DKI Jakarta provincial government, to talent scouting and open selection organised by the Central Java provincial government since 2014, and open promotion organised by the West Java provincial government (Wibowo 2020).

Central Java talent scouting is a form of activity to get potential cadres of Administrator Officers and Supervisory Officers. Talent scouting is attended by civil servants in the Central Java Provincial Government who have met the requirements and have been designated as nominative talent scouting participants. These participants include Supervisory Officers, Civil Servants with executive positions and Civil Servants with certain functional positions. The Central Java Provincial Government carried out talent scouting from 2015 to 2019.

As a result, a competency test evaluation by the assessment center is used to determine the State Civil Apparatus' appointment to the position of Administrator or Supervisor in the Central Java Government Environment based on the idea of professionalism. The ideal talent pool is indeed a way for the realization of efficient bureaucratic management (Aina and Atan 2020; Mau, Subarsono, and Purbokusumo 2020), instead of those who got their promotion through political intervention (Gibbs 2019; Hayat and Ngusmanto 2020; Muhibin, Nasution, and Bima 2022). Previous research has shown that talent management succeeds in getting the best and right talents to occupy certain positions (Barkhuizen and Gumede 2021; Martínez-Morán et al. 2021; Musakuro and De Klerk 2021).

The goal of talent scouting within the Central Java Provincial Government is to get the best Civil Servants through a selection process as potential cadres who can be considered for promotion to Supervisors and Administrators. The Central Java Provincial Government presents an intriguing subject for research due to its standing as the government with the most accomplished bureaucratic reform in 2017. Notably, one aspect of this reform pertains to employee promotion through the implementation of talent scouting.

The talent scouting is expected to contribute to improving the quality of human resources through coaching and employee development. In addition, talent scouting is also expected to guarantee the fulfillment of equal rights and opportunities for Civil Servants to occupy Administrator and Supervisor positions within the Central Java Provincial Government with the help of technology (Montero Guerra, Danvila-del-Valle, and Méndez Suárez 2023).

Despite of those possibilities, Morland, etc mentioned that talent management have bad consequences (Painter-Morland et al. 2019). Since the start of talent scouting, applicants have never reached 50% of the

number of Civil Servants who are eligible to take part in the talent scouting program (nominative). In addition, the results of talent scouting in Central Java Province have not been utilized effectively, there is a talent pool from 2015 to 2017 that has not been promoted while the 2018 talent pool has participated in a promotion.

Even the availability of the talent pool and the results of the assessment are also not used as basic guidelines in providing Civil Servants guidance and development programs or the basis for placement according to individual qualifications/competencies. Therefore, it is important to analyze the use of talent pools within the Central Java Provincial Government which aims to analyze more deeply what factors cause the use of the said talent pool to be less effective

METHODS

This study aims to analyze the extent to which the talent pool is utilized within the Central Java Provincial Government. A qualitative approach is considered appropriate because the researcher wants to dig in depth regarding the extent to which the talent pool is utilized within the Central Java Provincial Government and the factors causing the ineffectiveness of the talent pool. Qualitative research is a suitable method for investigating the meaning behind the challenges encountered in utilising the talent pool, which is regarded as a social issue. The method allows for an in-depth exploration and understanding of the problem, avoiding subjective evaluations (Aspers and Corte 2019). Furthermore, primary data was collected through interviews with informants and examination of documents from the implementation report of the talent pool programme.

Determination of informants in this study is by using a purposive sampling technique, the criteria used are that the informant is an official or employee at the Regional Civil Service Agency of Central Java Province.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Law Number 5 of 2014 concerning the State Civil Apparatus states that the Administrator Position and the Supervisory Position are Administrative Positions that have functions and duties related to public services as well as government administration and development. The official occupying the Administrator Position has the responsibility of leading the implementation of all activity's public services and government administration and development. Meanwhile, the Official who occupies the position of Supervisor is responsible for controlling the implementation of activities carried out by the Executing Officer.

Thus, the Administrative Position and the Supervisory Position become strategic positions in supporting the bureaucracy to be more responsive, progressive and participatory both through public service duties, government duties and the development tasks it is currently carrying out. The following tasks must be carried out by officials who can guarantee the integrity and accountability of the office. The tasks carried out by Administrator Officers and Supervisory Officers are strategic tasks, so in the

appointment and placement of Administrator Officers and Supervisory Officers a selection mechanism is needed that takes into account the needs of the organization.

Government Regulation Number 11 of 2017 concerning Management of Civil Servants which regulates the filling of Administrator Positions and Supervisory Positions explains that civil servants can be promoted as long as they meet the requirements of the position, taking into account the needs of the organization. The regulation also stipulates that filling the Administrator and Supervisory Positions must meet the competency requirements according to the qualifications for the position and have a minimum good performance assessment in the last two years. For agencies that do not yet have a succession plan, promotions in Administrative Positions can be carried out through internal selection by a selection committee formed by the head of the organization with an objective, transparent and merit-based selection mechanism.

The selection mechanism that is objective, transparent and based on a merit system aims to filter candidates for office; so that those who will be elected are candidates who have integrity, competence, qualifications, good performance, and are able to manage all differences, both from cultural, ethnic, religious backgrounds and interests. Administrative Officers and Oversight Officers are required to carry out public service duties, government duties and development tasks optimally, so that leaders who have integrity, high competence, are service oriented, and have a spirit of cooperation are needed in carrying out their roles. Thus, the Government needs to choose and place an official who will occupy the position of administrator or supervisor appropriately, so that the official who occupies that position has professionalism, care, superior morals, and is clean.

Since 2015 the selection mechanism for filling administrator positions and supervisory positions has been carried out by the Provincial Government of Central Java through talent scouting activities. Talent scouting has actually been implemented in Central Java Province as a process of obtaining the best, high-performing civil servants who have high competence and potential to become part of the talent pool and fill the positions of Supervisors and Administrators. The Head of Employee Planning and Development at the Central Java Provincial Civil Service Agency explained that there are several stages in talent scouting selection. First, administrative selection, followed by an idea test and competency test. The test of written ideas is called an analysis problem.

The administrative selection stages of the talent pool are carried out to select prospective talents based on performance, so that the initial requirements are rank, education, and performance appraisal. Furthermore, at the idea testing stage, the assessment is carried out by assessing the technical competency abilities of the candidates. The final stage is the competency test referring to the Minister of State Apparatus Empowerment Regulation No. 38 of 2017. The three stages of this selection are designed to obtain human resources who are ready to be placed in higher positions that are in accordance with the specified competencies, qualifications and performance.

There are fundamental differences in the current Civil Servants competency test with the previous ones. The implementation of the 2016 Civil Servants competency test selects for administrator and supervisor positions by combining competence capacity and potential. Since then, the government of Central Java Province realized that it was necessary to add competencies that represent the identity of Central Java people. The first value is integrity, this is related to the tagline of the Governor of Central Java 'no corruption, no lying'. Next is competence or ability to cooperate. Collaboration abstracted from the spirit of gotong royong is a hallmark of the people of Central Java. The last is service-oriented competence. Civil Servant as part of the public service agenda, of course, must have a soul to serve. Civil Servant who do not meet a minimum of two competencies will automatically be dropped at the initial selection stage.

The Provincial Government of Central Java has made adjustments to competency standards in conducting competency tests for Civil Servants who will occupy administrator positions or supervisory positions in accordance with qualifications, competencies and performance. Ideally, after the talent scouting or the selection and assessment process ends, the results can be submitted by the Agency to the participating agencies to be informed to the assessee or assessee superiors to get feedback on the results of the talent scouting. The results of the assessment can be used by participating agencies and talent scouting participants to plan self-development and plan their careers.

However, in reality that is not the case. The results of the participants' assessment were not openly conveyed to the participating agencies and talent scouting participants. In general, only the names of participants who pass to become the talent pool are announced. Agency through the Civil Servants Competency Assessment Unit has provided an opportunity for civil servants talent scouting participants who are declared not to pass into the talent pool to take part in counseling and feedback activities. However, these activities did not run optimally as expected.

The results of the assessment of talent scouting participants have not been openly conveyed to the participating agencies and those concerned. In relation to this, both agencies and participants who pass or do not pass the talent pool will not know the overall competency test results and what competency development needs are like if they do not take part in the counseling and feedback activities organized by the Agency. This was disclosed by the Head of the Outpatient Nursing, Rehabilitation and Community Mental Health Section, Amino Gondhohutomo Hospital, Central Java Province. The said informant has participated in talent scouting four times for the administrator position in the health cluster and has never been declared qualified to become a talent pool.

When the results of the assessment are not fully informed to the participants, distrust will appear from the participants towards the process and results of talent scouting. Feedback/counseling mechanisms and ways of accessing them that have not been well socialized also contributed to being part of supporting the participants' pessimism about the selection process for forming the said talent pool. In addition, the counseling and feedback mechanisms that must be carried out directly (face to face) are still quite

burdensome for participants whose work locations are far away, considering that the Central Java Provincial Government has several government organization throughout the Central Java region or outside Semarang City. This is also coupled with the implementation of counseling and feedback which cannot be done at any time. Participants must confirm in advance to ensure counseling and feedback schedules or participants must adjust the counselor's schedule.

Additionally, there exists a distinct process for advancing or selecting a pool of skilled individuals to assume roles in both administrative and supervisory positions within the Central Java Provincial Government. In adherence with Government Regulation Number 11 of 2017, which pertains to the Management of Civil Servants, promotions for administrative civil servants will be determined by the Agency based on evaluations from the Civil Servants Performance Assessment Team within government agencies. Priority for promotions is given to those included in the succession plan group. In this regard, the Central Java Provincial Government plans to appoint a talent pool to fill administrative positions. Priority will be given to civil servants who are already part of the talent pool within the Central Java Provincial Government. The aim is to ensure a fair and objective selection process that promotes meritocracy. Technical abbreviations, if any, will be explained at their first instance of use.

The mechanism for appointing a talent pool to occupy administrator positions or supervisory positions in the Central Java Provincial Government is carried out when the Civil Service Development Officer, in this case the Governor, wants a Structural Position arrangement. Structural position arrangement is also based on the results of the latest report regarding the condition of structural position vacancies by the Agency. The name of the talent pool recommended for promotion or filling the intended structural position is of course Civil Servants who have gone through the talent scouting process.

As previously discussed, talent scouting is an objective assessment process in forming a talent pool that is carried out to minimize subjectivity in the appointment of Civil Servants for promotion. After the objective process is carried out, there is still a subjective assessment process at the Assessment Team session in the appointment of a talent pool for promotion. The subjective assessment process referred to is the process of observing the talent pool which is carried out on leaders and their work environment to obtain other information that is not obtained from the talent scouting process.

Observations were made before and when the civil servants became a talent pool. The process of observing the talent pool in the organization will become another source of information to support the objective process of talent scouting. When appointing the name of the talent pool to be promoted, in the trial the Assessment Team are no longer saw the results of the assessment of the competency test of the talent pool, whether there were deficiencies or advantages. As long as what is proposed is a talent pool, then those names will be considered.

There is no further explanation of the reasons why they were not appointed for promotion to the talent pool. Access to information related to this is very limited. The talent pool had previously signed a statement that they would not demand positions and were ready to be placed anywhere. So it is still

considered taboo when there is a question "why wasn't I promoted?" Ideally, the Agency of Central Java Province will provide information openly to the talent pool that has not been appointed. So they understand the reasons why they are not recommended or not appointed for promotion. Furthermore, the information referred to can also be taken into consideration for them to carry out self-development.

The number of talent pools available from 2015 to 2018 which were promoted to both administrator and supervisor positions was dominated by the male talent pool. The percentage of female talent pool who are promoted to administrator positions almost never exceeds 50% of the available talent pool. A similar condition also occurs in female talent pools who are promoted to supervisory positions, almost never exceeding 50% of the available talent pool except in 2015.

The male pool of talented workers is favoured for promotion over their female counterparts due to issues related to family and distance from their residences. Previously, this talent pool had signed an agreement specifying their aversion to demanding positions and being prepared to serve in any position. Furthermore, hindering full utilisation of the talent pool to occupy the Administrator or Supervisory Position is the unavailability of current information in the Personnel Information System.

Furthermore, it turns out that there are still female talent pools who are reluctant to be promoted outside their area of residence. Based on information from informants, this could make the composition of structural officials in a region unbalanced if the talent pool is mostly filled by women. So that Agency prefers not to recommend and promote the talent pool because it is considered not to comply with the statement agreement that has been made.

The aim of being part of the talent pool is to become cadres who will later be prepared to occupy positions one level above them. Considering that the validity period of the talent pool in the Central Java Provincial Government is only four years, it certainly makes the talent pool have hopes of being appointed to administrator positions or supervisory positions within the four year period. When the previous year's talent pool (senior talent pool) had not been appointed but had appointed a new talent pool, this clearly raised questions for the senior talent pool, especially those who had not been promoted.

Supposedly, the appointment of a talent pool for promotion must be adjusted to the time when the Civil Servants are joined the talent pool. If there is a promotion by appointing a new talent pool and not from the senior talent pool, then there must be a party responsible for explaining related matters. Furthermore, when the expectations of the talent pool are not in accordance, there is concern that there will be distrust of the process or mechanism for appointing the talent pool for promotion, even to the damage of the psychological contract of the talent pool.

Psychological contract is a reciprocal concept of someone who is involved in a social exchange and in it there is an effort between them to be reciprocated by other parties for their respective efforts (Herrera and De Las Heras-Rosas 2021). Furthermore, Abasilim, Gberevbie, and Osibanjo (2019) also explained that in an organization, there is a fact that there is a norm where organizational leaders often make commitments to their employees about the future so that they continue to strive to do their best work and remain loyal to

the organization. The focus of the psychological contract for the talent pool is of course something that has a long-term relationship and grows their loyalty, such as intensive training or self-development. The organization will encourage the talent pool to contribute commitment, best performance and loyalty to the organization and in return, the organization strives for their professional career development

Furthermore, He, Chen, and Shafait (2023) stated that violations of psychological contracts can lead to withdrawal of commitments to a reluctance to work harder or have high performance. Related to this, it can be concluded that there must be openness between talent pool expectations and organizational expectations, so that each of them has efforts to fulfill them and the risk of psychological contract violations can be minimized.

The competency test results which can be informed through counseling and feedback activities to the talent pool itself have not yet become a part of talent scouting activities. Competency assessment and counseling/feedback are different activities from the Civil Servants Competency Assessment Unit in Central Java Province. In addition, based on information from informants, that counseling and feedback activities are not part of the Agency authority, so these activities will only be scheduled when there is a request from the user. The time is limited, the implementation must be face to face, and the lack of socialization makes the counseling and feedback activities less than optimal.

CONCLUSION

Based on the discussion above, the researcher concludes that the results of the talent pool assessment have not really been used as a basis or material for Civil Servants competency development, especially for the talent pool. In fact, identification of the needs for the talent pool development program can be obtained from the assessment results when they carry out talent scouting. There are several factors that influence this to occur, first, the results of the assessment or competency test results have not been properly administered so that they cannot be conveyed openly to parties related to the provision of development programs including the talent pool agencies and the talent pools themselves. Second, the reporting of assessment results or competency test results through counseling and feedback activities did not run optimally. Third, there is no coordination regarding the clarity of authority between related agencies, and the lack of availability of resources in following up the results of assessments or results of competency tests.

REFERENCES

- Abasilim, U. D., D. E. Gbervbie, and O. A. Osibanjo. 2019. "Leadership Styles and Employees' Commitment: Empirical Evidence From Nigeria." *SAGE Open* 9(3).
- Aina, Riham Al, and Tarik Atan. 2020. "The Impact of Implementing Talent Management Practices on Sustainable Organizational Performance." *Sustainability (Switzerland)*.
- Aspers, Patrik, and Ugo Corte. 2019. "What Is Qualitative in Qualitative Research." *Qualitative Sociology* 42(2).
- Barkhuizen, Nicolene E., and Bongekile Gumede. 2021. "The Relationship between Talent Management,

- Job Satisfaction and Voluntary Turnover Intentions of Employees in a Selected Government Institution.” *SA Journal of Human Resource Management*.
- Gallardo-Gallardo, Eva, Marian Thunnissen, and Hugh Scullion. 2020. “Talent Management: Context Matters.” *International Journal of Human Resource Management*.
- Gibbs, Daniel. 2019. “Selection Rates and Bureaucratic Performance.” *Economics of Governance* 20(2):159–81.
- hartati, sri, Rikha Muliasari, and Andri Tri Madan. 2022. “Implementation of Filling Primary High Leadership Positions through A Job Fit Test in Jambi Provincial Government, Indonesia.” *TRANSFORMASI: Jurnal Manajemen Pemerintahan* 14(1 SE-Articles).
- Hayat, and Ngusmanto. 2020. “Promotion Pattern of Bureaucratic Official in the Direct Selection Era of Regional Head.” *Systematic Reviews in Pharmacy* 11(2):210–18.
- He, Zhenhua, Lifeng Chen, and Zahid Shafait. 2023. “How Psychological Contract Violation Impacts Turnover Intentions of Knowledge Workers? The Moderating Effect of Job Embeddedness.” *Heliyon* 9(3).
- Herrera, Juan, and Carlos De Las Heras-Rosas. 2021. “The Organizational Commitment in the Company and Its Relationship With the Psychological Contract.” *Frontiers in Psychology* 11.
- Martínez-Morán, Pedro César, Jose Maria Fernández Rico Urgoiti, Fernando Díez, and Josu Solabarrieta. 2021. “The Digital Transformation of the Talent Management Process: A Spanish Business Case.” *Sustainability (Switzerland)*.
- Mau, Severinus, A. G. Subarsono, and Yuyun Purbokusumo. 2020. “The Merit System’s Adaptation to the Implementation of Bureaucratic Official Recruitment and Promotion Policy in South Central Timor Regency.” *Policy & Governance Review* 4(3):245.
- Montero Guerra, José Manuel, Ignacio Danvila-del-Valle, and Mariano Méndez Suárez. 2023. “The Impact of Digital Transformation on Talent Management.” *Technological Forecasting and Social Change* 188:122291.
- Muhibin, Mochamad, Eli Sanur Nasution, and Ghandi Bima. 2022. “KLEPTOCRACY OF BRIBERY IN PROMOTING POSITION IN INDONESIA THE PERSPECTIVE OF THE SOCIOLOGY OF LAW.” *Dinamika Penelitian: Media Komunikasi Penelitian Sosial Keagamaan* 22(01).
- Musakuro, Rhodrick N., and Frances De Klerk. 2021. “Academic Talent: Perceived Challenges to Talent Management in the South African Higher Education Sector.” *SA Journal of Human Resource Management*.
- Pagan-Castaño, Esther, José Carlos Ballester-Miquel, Javier Sánchez-García, and María Guijarro-García. 2022. “What’s next in Talent Management?” *Journal of Business Research*.
- Painter-Morland, Mollie, Susan Kirk, Ghislain Deslandes, and Carole Tansley. 2019. “Talent Management: The Good, the Bad, and the Possible.” *European Management Review*.
- Setiadhie, Herru, and Galih Wibowo. 2020. “Kebijakan Talent Scouting Jabatan Administator Dan

Pengawas Pemerintah Provinsi Jawa Tengah.” *JDKP Jurnal Desentralisasi Dan Kebijakan Publik*.
Wibowo, Galih. 2020. “MANAJEMEN INOVASI : PROMOSI DALAM MENDUKUNG SISTEM
MERIT DI BKD PROVINSI JAWA BARAT.” *Jurnal Manajemen Publik & Kebijakan Publik*
(*JMPKP*) 2(1).