

Meta-Analysis: The Effectiveness of Using Blended Learning on Multiple Intelligences and Student Character Education during the Covid-19 Period

Karlini Oktarina¹, Suhaimi², Tomi Apra Santosa³, Abdul Razak⁴, Irdawati⁵, Yuni Ahda⁶, Lufri⁷. Dwi Hilda Putri⁸

1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8 IAIN Kerinci, Indonesia

karlinioktarina@gmail.com¹, suhaimi@gmail.com², santosatomiapra@gmail.com³, ar710233@gmail.com⁴, irdawati@gmail.com⁵, yuniahda@gmail.com⁶, lufri_unp@yahoo.com⁷, dwihildaputri@yahoo.com8

ABSTRACT

the value of effect size (ES) is 0.44 and the N-Gain is 0.65 category medium.

This study aims to determine the effectiveness of the use of integrated blended learning on multiple intelligences (multiple intelligence) and student character education during the COVID-19 period. This type of research is a meta-analysis research. The research sample came from a search of 21 national and international journals. Search articles through databases sourced from Google Scholar, Eric, IEEE, Science Director and Wiley. The sample selection technique is purposive sampling technique. The data sampled relates to the use of Blended Learning, Multiple Intelligence and character education. Data analysis used quantitative data analysis techniques by conducting effect size and N-Gain tests using JASP software version 26. The results showed that the use of STEM integrated blended learning was effective in increasing students' multiple intelligence with an average value of 76.25 and student character education of 75 with



Keywords:

Covid-19.

Blended Learning;

Multiple Intelligence;

Character education;

Article History: Received: 30-10-2021 Revised : 07-11-2021 Accepted: 08-11-2021 Online :06-12-2021

 $\odot \odot \odot$ This is an open access article under the CC-BY-SA license Crossref https://doi.org/10.31764/ijeca.v4i3.5505

A. INTRODUCTION

The industrial revolution 5.0 society has had such a great influence on human life. In the Industrial 5.0 era, all human work has been exposed to digital technology (Amin, 2017). Digital technology is the latest breakthrough that humans are able to get information quickly. All digital technology equipment can be accessed via the internet, including educational issues (Hasbullah, 2015). Education is an important concern for the progress of a country.

Education is something that can provide great progress on the quality of human resources (Widiara, 2018). Education in the 21st century must be supported by technology (F. A. Müller & Wulf, 2021). Technology helps the teaching and learning process to be interesting and effective. The use of technology is very helpful for students and lecturers in presenting subject matter (Oncu & Bichelmeyer, 2021). However, the learning system between students and lecturers has become limited since the spread of the Covid-19 virus.

Coronavirus disease-19 (Covid-19) is a type of virus that has made the world experience a health crisis that attacks the respiratory system (Chaturvedi et al., 2021; Mishra et al., 2020). The Covid-19 virus was first identified in Wuhan, China (Abuhammad, 2020). This virus has attacked ± 200 countries in the world (Latif, 2020). In Indonesia Virus-Covid-19 was first confirmed in Indonesia on March 11, 2020 (Oyedotun, 2020). This virus causes the face-to-face learning system to be online. Therefore, students and teachers must adapt the learning system. However, with these changes, it will affect multiple intelligences and character education in students.

Multiple intelligences are the concern of educators in realizing the quality of students (Karbono & Retnawati, 2020). Multiple intelligence is a person who has eight intelligences, namely logical, mathematical, kinesthetic, musical, interpersonal, personal, visual linguistic and verbal spatial intelligence. (Ahamad *et al.*, 2021; (Wilson, 2018). With this intelligence a person can easily solve various problems. Not only that, Multiple Intelligence (MI) is able to make it easier for teachers to see students' interests and talents (Erdem & Keklik, 2020). In addition, lecturers must be able to grow with character education in students. Therefore, it is necessary to have effective learning used to grow MI and student character, namely blended learning.

Blended learning is a very modern learning concept based on technology (Alsarayreh, 2020; Lapitan *et al.*, 2021). Blended learning can be done by educators face-to-face and online. In addition, with blended learning, teachers are able to apply learning technology to students easily (Morgan & Spies, 2020). Blended learning can improve student learning outcomes and achievement (Graham *et al.*, 2019; Santosa dkk, 2021).

Prior research by (Setiawan *et al.*, 2019) shows that blended learning is very effective to be applied in higher education. According to (Alrouji, 2020) learning with blended learning can improve writing competence in students. Research (Eryilmaz, 2015) states that blended learning is effective to be applied in a mixed learning environment. Study (Orcid *et al.*, 2019) stated that blended learning can improve student achievement and motivation. Study (Herlandy & Novalia, 2019) shows that STEM integrated blended learning is able to improve students' critical thinking. Therefore, this study aims to determine the effectiveness of the use of blended learning on multiple intelligence and student character education during the Covid-19 period.

B. METHODS

This research is a type of meta-analysis research. Meta-analysis research is a type of research that performs statistical calculations to perform data analysis (Santosa *et al.*, 2021). The research sample came from 24 national and international journals. The sample search used databases from Google Scholar, Eric, Sciencedirect, IEEE and Springer. The sample selection technique is a purposive sampling technique. The sample selection took into account data related to the use of blended learning, multiple intelligence and character education in students. The data analysis technique used is quantitative and qualitative data analysis techniques by calculating the effect size and N-Gain values with JASP software. Criteria Effect Size (ES) asa Table 1 below.

Table. 1 Criteria Effect Size (ES)		
Effect size (ES)	Criteria	
$0 \le ES \le 0,2$	Low	
$0.2 \le ES \le 0.8$	Medium	
ES ≥ 0,8	Hight	
(Sumbor Cohon dolom (Khoiri 2010)		

(Sumber: Cohen dalam (Khoiri, 2019)

N-Gain values with JASP software as Table 2 below.

186 | IJECA (International Journal of Education and Curriculum Application) Vol. 4, No. 3, December 2021, pp. 184-192

Table 2. Criteria N-Gain			
N-Gain	Criteria		
g > 0.7	Hight		
$0.3 \le g \le 0.7$	Medium		
g < 0.3	Low		

C. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

From the results of the analysis of 21 national and international articles published in 2011-2021 related to the use of integrated blended learning, the STEM approach can be seen in the Table 3 below.

Table 3. Meta-analysis of the Use of Blended Learning					
No	Author	Artictle	Database	Effect Size	
1	(Huda dkk, 2019)	Nasional	Google Scholar	0.61	
2	(Putra <i>et al.</i> , 2020)	Nasional	Google Sholar	0.32	
3	(Rofifah, 2020)	Nasional	Google Scholar	0.41	
4	(Ma & Lee, 2021)	Internasional	Eric	0.72	
5	(Eryilmaz, 2015)	Internasional	Eric	0.47	
6	(Yudhana, 2021)	Internasional	Eric	0.35	
7	(Müller& Mildenberger, 2021)	Internasional	Sciencedirect	0.23	
8	(Reilly <i>et al.</i> , 2020)	Internasional	Sciencedirect	0.67	
9	(Wong <i>et al.,</i> 2020)	Internasional	Eric	0.81	
10	(Bangkom & Sukavatee, 2021)	Internasional	Eric	0.33	
11	(Vo et al., 2017)	Internasional	Sciencedirect	0.71	
12	(Yuliana, 2019)	Nasional	Google Scholar	0.32	
13	(Hasanah <i>et al.,</i> 2020)	Internasional	Eric	0.21	
14	(Ariawan & Divayana, 2020)	Internasional	IEEE	0.39	
15	(Bains <i>et al.,</i> 2011)	Internasional	Wiley	0.48	
16	(Hikmat <i>et al.,</i> 2020)	Nasional	Google Scholar	0.20	
17	(Yana, 2019)	Nasional	Google Scholar	0.27	
18	(Akhmalia <i>et al</i> ., 2018)	Nasional	Google Scholar	0.36	
19	(Mustakim, 2020)	Nasional	Google Scholar	0.24	
20	(Ranjan, 2020)	Internasional	Wiley	0.63	
21	(Abdelraheem, 2014)	Internasional	Eric	0.27	
22	(Ho, 2016)	Internasional	Eric	0.55	
Nilai Rata-rata Effect Size 0,44					

Table 3 shows a meta-analysis of the use of blended learning from 22 reference articles where there are 8 national articles and 14 international articles with an average effect size (ES) of 0.44. Not only that, browsing articles through a database that can be seen in the Figure 1 below.



Figure 1. Article Database Meta-Analysis

Figure 1 explains that the use of blended learning is accessed through 5 databases, namely 8 journals from Google Scholar, 3 journals from ScienceDirect, 8 journals from Eric, 1 journal from IEEE and 2 journals from Wiley. In addition, meta-analysis was also carried out based on the type of research that can be seen in Table 4 below.

Table. 4 Meta-analysis by Type of Research				
No	Research Type	Jumlah	Persentase (%)	
1	Exsperiment	17	78	
2	Meta-Analysis	1	4	
3	Quantitative	4	18	

Based on Table 4, there are three types of research related to the use of blended learning in learning, namely experimental research by 78%, meta-analysis by 1% and quantitative by 18%. However, the use of blended learning on multiple intelligences (Multiple intelligence) in students and character education can be seen in Table 5 below.

19 era			
No	Intelligence Aspect —	C	lass
		Control	Exsperiment
1	Logica	65	75
2	Verbal	60	70
3	Music	60	80
4	Kinestetik	77	85
5	Interpersonal	60	70
6	Intrapersonal	55	75
7	Mathamatic	50	75
8	Spasial Verbal	60	80
	Mean	61	76.25

Table. 5 Average Value of the Use of Blended Learning on Multiple Intelligence students in the Covid-

From Table. 4 explains that the average score (mean) of students who use blended learning in learning in the Covid-19 era before and after experiencing an increase. This can be seen in the control class that does not use blended learning, students only get a score of 61 and in the experimental class that uses blended learning students get a score of 76.25. In addition, the use of blended learning for student character education can be seen in Table 6 below.

188 | IJECA (International Journal of Education and Curriculum Application)

Vol. 4, No. 3, December 2021, pp. 184-192

		LIa	
Na	Aspect	C	lass
NO		Control	Exsperiment
1	Honesty	60	70
2	Creative	55	75
3	Independence	60	75
4	Diciplin	60	75
5	Like to read	50	80
6	Curiosity	55	80
7	Hard Work	55	70
	Nilai rata-rata	56,42	75

 Table. 6 Value of Character Education in Students Using Blended Learning in the Covid-19 Pandemic

 Fra

Table. 5 explains the value of education for students who use blended learning in the Covid-19 era which is seen from 7 aspects, namely honesty, creativity, independence, discipline, love of reading, curiosity and hard work. The use of blended learning is very well used in the Covid-19 era. It can be seen that there is an increase in the class of affective values (student attitudes). Where the control class that does not use student blended learning only has an average score of 56.42 and the experimental class that uses blended learning in the Covid-19 era gets an average score of 75. To see the effectiveness of using blended learning on Multiple intelligence and student character education , then the N-gain test is performed. The results of the N-gain test can be seen in Table 7 below.

Table. 7 N-gain Test Results					
Class	Nilai		N-Gain	Effort Sizo	Category
	Pretest	Postest		Effect Size	
Control	65	70	0.65	0.44	Madium
Exsperiment	50	85	0,05	0,44	Medium

Based on Table 6, the N-gain value in the control class is 0.5 in the medium category and the N-gain value in the experimental class is 0.8 in the high category. This means that the use of blended learning is very effective in increasing multiple intelligence and character education for students in the Covid-19 era.

The use of blended learning in the Covid-19 era is very effectively applied to students. This is based on the N-gain value of 0.65 and the Effect size of 0.44 in the high category. This opinion is in line with(Gide *et al*, 2017) stated that blended learning was effectively implemented to help distance learning in the Covid-19 era. In addition, blended learning can increase students' learning motivation compared to conventional learning (Wong *et al.*, 2020). Effective blended learning in collaboration with learning technology (Chan, 2014; Huang *et al.*, 2021).

Learning should be able to make students understand the material easily and effectively. Blended learning or learning that is carried out offline and online is effectively used in various situations (Yick *et al.*, 2019). This is clearly very beneficial for educators and students in solving problems in education. The Covid-19 pandemic is not so much a problem for students to always study. According to (Hong *et al.*, 2013) By applying blended learning in universities, it is able to foster enthusiasm and train students to stay focused on learning. Not only that, blended learning is able to increase multiple intelligences (Multiple Intelligence and character education in students).

Multiple intelligence is a person's multiple intelligences. The use of blended learning is suitable for increasing multiple intelligences or multiple intelligences. This can be seen from the scores of students who use blended learning of 76.25. This is in line with the opinion (Prajitno &

Ladyawati, 2019) Blended learning is able to approach multiple intelligences in students. Multiple intelligences (multiple intelligences) can help educators to grow the potential and talents of students (Ghaznavi *et al.*, 2021). According to (Jones, 2017) Students have multiple intelligences that make it easier for educators to organize the concepts of the material being studied. In addition, character education in the Covid-19 era should be cultivated in students.

Character education is a very important thing to consider in realizing the quality of learning. Learning with Blended learning has been able to foster character education for students in the Covid-19 era. This can be seen from the student character education value of 75. This is in line with the opinion of (Putri, 2013) stated that the cultivation of character education is very necessary for students. According to (Arsanti, 2018) with character education helps improve students' creative skills. In addition, it can foster a sense of caring for each other (Qoyyimah, 2016).

D. CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTIONS

Based on the research above, it can be concluded that the use of STEM-integrated blended learning is effective in increasing students' multiple intelligence with an average value of 76.25 and student character education of 75 with an effect size (ES) value of 0.44 and an N-Gain of 0.65 category medium. In addition, the researcher gives advice to other researchers to continue this research in the future.

REFERENCES

- Abdelraheem, A. Y. (2014). Enhancing Students' Learning and Self- Efficacy Through Blended Learning in a Teachers' Program. *I-Manager's Journal of Educational Technology*, *10*(4), 29– 39. https://doi.org/10.26634/jet.10.4.2607
- Abuhammad, S. (2020). Heliyon Barriers to distance learning during the COVID-19 outbreak : A qualitative review from parents ' perspective. *Heliyon*, 6(1),. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2020.e05482
- Ahamad, A. N., Samsudin, M. A., Ismail, M. E., & Ahmad, N. J. (2021). Enhancing the Achievement in Physics' Motion Concept through Online Multiple Intelligence Learning Approach. *Eurasia Journal of Mathematics, Science and Technology Education*, 17(2), 1–11. https://doi.org/10.29333/ejmste/9698
- Akhmalia, N. L., Suana, W., & Maharta, N. (2018). Efektivitas Blended Learning Berbasis LMS dengan Model Pembelajaran Inkuiri pada Materi Fluida Statis terhadap Penguasaan Konsep Siswa. *JIPFRI (Jurnal Inovasi Pendidikan Fisika Dan Riset Ilmiah)*, *2*(2), 56–64. https://doi.org/10.30599/jipfri.v2i2.299
- AlRouji, O. (2020). The Effectiveness of Blended Learning in Enhancing Saudi Students' Competence in Paragraph Writing. *English Language Teaching*, *13*(9), 72. https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v13n9p72
- Alsarayreh, R. (2020). Using blended learning during COVID-19: The perceptions of school teachers in Jordan. *Cypriot Journal of Educational Sciences*, *15*(6), 1544–1556. https://doi.org/10.18844/CJES.V15I6.5298
- Amin, A. K. (2017). Kajian Konseptual Model Pembelajaran Blended Learning berbasis Web untuk Meningkatkan Hasil Belajar dan Motivasi Belajar. *JURNAL PENDIDIKAN EDUTAMA*, 4(2), 51–64.
- Ariawan, I. P. W., & Divayana, D. G. H. (2020). Design of blended learning based on tri kaya parisudha using kelase platform in realizing hybrid-superitem learning in mathematics lessons. *International Journal of Instruction*, *13*(3), 679–698. https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2020.13346a
- Arsanti, M. (2018). Pengembangan Bahan Ajar Mata Kuliah Penulisan Kreatif Bermuatan Nilai-

190 | IJECA (International Journal of Education and Curriculum Application) Vol. 4, No. 3, December 2021, pp. 184-192

Nilai Pendidikan Karakter Religius Bagi Mahasiswa Prodi Pbsi, Fkip, Unissula. *KREDO:* Jurnal Ilmiah Bahasa Dan Sastra, 1(2), 71–90. https://doi.org/10.24176/kredo.v1i2.2107

- Bains, M., Reynolds, P. A., Mcdonald, F., & Sherriff, M. (2011). Effectiveness and acceptability of face-to-face, blended and e-learning: A randomised trial of orthodontic undergraduates. *European Journal of Dental Education*, *15*(2), 110–117. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1600-0579.2010.00651.x
- Bangkom, K., & Sukavatee, P. (2021). Effects of oracy building instruction via blended-learning environment on thai students' metacognitive awareness and oracy skills. *LEARN Journal: Language Education and Acquisition Research Network*, *14*(1), 240–293.
- Chan, C. H. Y. (2014). Building an online library for interpretation training: Explorations into an effective blended-learning mode. *Computer Assisted Language Learning*, *27*(5), 454–479. https://doi.org/10.1080/09588221.2013.770034
- Chaturvedi, K., Vishwakarma, D. K., & Singh, N. (2021). Children and Youth Services Review COVID-19 and its impact on education, social life and mental health of students : A survey. *Children and Youth Services Review*, *121*(2), 105-866. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.childyouth.2020.105866
- Erdem, D., & Keklik, İ. (2020). Multiple Intelligences Profiles in Prospective Teachers. *Education Reform Journal*, *5*(1), 27–44. https://doi.org/10.22596/erj2020.05.01.27.44
- Eryilmaz, M. (2015). The Effectiveness Of Blended Learning Environments. *Contemporary Issues in Education Research (CIER)*, 8(4), 251–256. https://doi.org/10.19030/cier.v8i4.9433
- Ghaznavi, N., Haddad Narafshan, M., & Tajadini, M. (2021). The Implementation of a Multiple Intelligences Teaching Approach: Classroom engagement and physically disabled learners. *Cogent Psychology*, *8*(1). https://doi.org/10.1080/23311908.2021.1880258
- Gide, A. (2017). Pengembangan Perangkat Model Blended Learning untuk Meningkatkan Efektivitas Penerapan Pendidikan Jarak Jauh di SMKN 2 Gerun. *Jurnal Pendidikan*, 4(2), 173–1.
- Graham, C. R., Borup, J., Pulham, E., & Larsen, R. (2019). K–12 Blended Teaching Readiness: Model and Instrument Development. *Journal of Research on Technology in Education*, *51*(3), 239–258. https://doi.org/10.1080/15391523.2019.1586601
- Hasanah, H., Makassar, U. N., Street, A. P. P., Makassar, U. N., Street, A. P. P., Planning, H. E., & Board, C. (2020). *Cypriot Journal of Educational*. *15*(5), 1295–1306.
- Hasbullah, H. (2015). Blended Learning, Trend Strategi Pembelajaran Matematika Masa Depan. *Formatif: Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan MIPA*, 4(1), 49–56. https://doi.org/10.30998/formatif.v4i1.140
- Herlandy, P. B., & Novalia, M. (2019). Penerapan E-Learning Pada Pembelajaran Komunikasi Dalam Jaringan Dengan Metode Blended Learning Bagi Siswa SMK. *Journal of Education Informatic Technology and Science*, 1(1), 24–33.
- Hikmat, Hermawan, E., Aldim, & Irwandi. (2020). Efektivitas Pembalajaran Daring Selama Masa Pandemi Covid-19. *Digital Library, UIN SUnan Gung Djati, Bandung*, 1–7.
- Ho, V. (2016). Blended learning model on hands-on approach for in-service secondary school teachers: Combination of E-learning and face-to-face discussion. *Education and Information Technologies*, *21*(1), 185–208. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10639-014-9315-y
- Hong, J. C., Tsai, C. M., Ho, Y. J., Hwang, M. Y., & Wu, C. J. (2013). A comparative study of the learning effectiveness of a blended and embodied interactive video game for kindergarten students. *Interactive Learning Environments*, 21(1), 39–53. https://doi.org/10.1080/10494820.2010.542760
- Jones, E. (2017). One size fits all? Multiple intelligences and legal education. *Law Teacher*, *51*(1), 56–68. https://doi.org/10.1080/03069400.2015.1082238
- Karbono, K., & Retnawati, H. (2020). The Correlation between Religiosity and Multiple Intelligences: A Meta-Analysis. *International Journal of Instruction*, 14(1), 365–378. https://doi.org/10.29333/IJI.2021.14121A
- Khoiri, A. (2019). Meta Analysis Study: Effect of STEM (Science Technology Engineering and Mathematic) towards Achievement. *Formatif: Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan MIPA*, 9(1), 71–82.

https://doi.org/10.30998/formatif.v9i1.2937

- Latif, B. (2020). Kata kunci : Pembelajaran Bermakna, Analisis Real, Pembelajaran Daring, Covid-19. Jurnal Pengembangan Pembelajaran Matematika (JPPM SUKA), II(2), 79–88.
- Ma, L., & Lee, C. S. (2021). Evaluating the effectiveness of blended learning using the ARCS model. *Journal of Computer Assisted Learning*, *37*(5), 1397–1408. https://doi.org/10.1111/jcal.12579
- Morgan, J. J., & Spies, T. G. (2020). Integrating blended learning in middle school ELA classrooms to support diverse learners: Lessons learned. *Journal of School Administration Research and Development*, *5*(1), 44–51.
- Müller, C., & Mildenberger, T. (2021). Facilitating flexible learning by replacing classroom time with an online learning environment: A systematic review of blended learning in higher education. Educational Research Review, 34(April). https://doi.org/10.1016/j.edurev.2021.100394
- Müller, F. A., & Wulf, T. (2021). Blended Learning Environments That Work: An Evidence-Based Instructional Design For The Delivery Of Qualitative Management Modules. *International Journal of Management Education*, 19(3), 1–12. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijme.2021.100530
- Mustakim, M. (2020). Efektivitas Pembelajaran Daring Menggunakan Media Online Selama Pandemi Covid-19 Pada Mata Pelajaran Matematika. *Al Asma : Journal of Islamic Education*, 2(1), 1. https://doi.org/10.24252/asma.v2i1.13646
- O'Reilly, R., Ramjan, L. M., Fatayer, M., Stunden, A., & Gregory, L. R. (2020). Corrigendum To "First Year Undergraduate Nursing Students' Perceptions Of The Effectiveness Of Blended Learning Approaches For Nursing Numeracy. *Nurse Education in Practice*, 46(7).234-244 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nepr.2020.102825
- Öncü, S., & Bichelmeyer, B. A. (2021). Instructional practices affecting learner engagement in blended learning environments. *Participatory Educational Research*, *8*(3), 210–226. https://doi.org/10.17275/per.21.62.8.3
- Orcid, C. M., Ozgur, O., & Orcid, D. (2019). Effectiveness Of Gamification Elements In Blended.
- Oyedotun, T. D. (2020). Research in Globalization Sudden change of pedagogy in education driven by COVID-19 : Perspectives and evaluation from a developing country. *Research in Globalization*, *2*, 100029. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.resglo.2020.100029
- Prajitno, S. H., & Ladyawati, E. (2019). Efektivitas Modul Matematika Diskrit Berbasis Multiple Intelligences. *FIBONACCI: Jurnal Pendidikan Matematika Dan Matematika*, 5(1), 11. https://doi.org/10.24853/fbc.5.1.11-22
- Putra, I. G. W., Agustini, K., & Sudatha, I. G. W. (2020). *Tren dan Implementasi Blended Learning pada Bidang STEAM : Kajian Studi di Indonesia*. 1–13.
- Putri, N. A. (2013). Penanaman Nilai-Nilai Pendidikan Karakter Melalui Mata Pelajaran Sosiologi. *KOMUNITAS: International Journal of Indonesian Society and Culture, 3*(2), 205–215. https://doi.org/10.15294/komunitas.v3i2.2317
- Qoyyimah, U. (2016). Inculcating character education through EFL teaching in Indonesian state schools. *Pedagogies*, *11*(2), 109–126. https://doi.org/10.1080/1554480X.2016.1165618
- Ranjan, P. (2020). Is blended learning better than online learning for b.Ed students? *Journal of Learning for Development*, 7(3), 349–366.
- Rofifah, D. (2020).Pembelajaran Blended Learning di SMA. *Toward a Media History of Documents*, 2007, 12–26.
- Santosa, T. A., Razak, A., Arsih, F., & Sepriyani, E. M. (2021). Meta-Analysis : Science Learning Based on Local Wisdom Against Preserving School Environments During the Covid-19 Pandemic. *Journal of Biology Education*, *10*(2), 244–251.
- Setiawan, R., Mardapi, D., Pratama, A., & Ramadan, S. (2019). Efektivitas Blended Learning Dalam Inovasi Pendidikan Era. *Jurnal Inovasi Teknologi Pendidikan*, 6(2), 148–157.
- Syamsul huda, E. a. (2019). nderstanding of Mathematical Concepts in the Linear Equation with Two Variables: Impact of E-Learning and Blended Learning Using Google Classroom. *Al-Jabar: Jurnal Pendidikan Matematika*, *10*(2), 261–270.

- 192 | IJECA (International Journal of Education and Curriculum Application) Vol. 4, No. 3, December 2021, pp. 184-192
- Tomi Apra Santosa, Abdul Razak, Azwir Anhar, R. S. (2021). Efektivitas Model Blended Learning Terhadap Hasil Belajar Mahasiswa Pada Mata Kuliah Zoologi di Era Covid-19. *BIODIK: Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Biologi*, 7(1), 77–83.
- Vo, H. M., Zhu, C., & Diep, N. A. (2017). The effect of blended learning on student performance at course-level in higher education: A meta-analysis. *Studies in Educational Evaluation*, 53, 17– 28. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.stueduc.2017.01.002
- Widiara, I. K. (2018). Blended Learning Sebagai Alternatif Pembelajaran Di Era Digital. *Purwadita*, *2*(2), 50–56.
- Wong, K. T., Hwang, G. J., Goh, P. S. C., & Mohd Arrif, S. K. (2020). Effects of blended learning pedagogical practices on students' motivation and autonomy for the teaching of short stories in upper secondary English. *Interactive Learning Environments*, 28(4), 512–525. https://doi.org/10.1080/10494820.2018.1542318
- Yana, D. (2019). Efektivitas Penggunaan Platform Lms Sebagai Media Pembelajaran Berbasis Blended Learning Terhadap Hasil Belajar Mahasiswa, Jurnal Pendidikan IPA. 8(1), 1–12.
- Yick, K. lun, Yip, J., Au, S. chuen, Lai, Y. yan, & Yu, A. (2019). Effectiveness of blended learning in the first year of fashion education. *International Journal of Fashion Design, Technology and Education*, 12(2), 178–188. https://doi.org/10.1080/17543266.2018.1546910
- Yudhana, S. (2021). The Implementation of Blended Learning to Enhance English Reading Skills of Thai Undergraduate Students. *English Language Teaching*, 14(7), 1. https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v14n7p1
- Yuliana, I. (2019). Efektivitas Penerapan Blended Learning dengan Moodle sebagai Media Pembelajaran untuk Mata Pelajaran Simulasi Digital. *PROtek : Jurnal Ilmiah Teknik Elektro*, 6(1). https://doi.org/10.33387/protk.v6i1.998